

Pol. 603: MEDIEVAL POLITICAL PHILOSOPHY. Fall 2017.
Dr. Thomas West. Hillsdale College.

Tentative make-up classes: Sunday, Sept. 17, 4:00-5:30pm; Nov. 5, Sunday, 4:00-5:30pm.

THOMAS AQUINAS (1225 - 1274, born and died in Italy). 19 days.

Abbreviations:

I = Part I (Prima Pars)

I-II = First Part of the Second Part (Prima Secundae)

II-II = Second Part of the Second Part (Secunda Secundae)

a.1 = Read all of Article 1, including the objections and replies to objections.

a.10 ad 3 = Article 10, Objection 3 and the Reply to Objection 3 (skip everything else in that article).

a.2 resp. = Read only the sections of Article 2 beginning with *Sed contra* (“On the contrary”) and *Respondeo* (“I answer that”). The objections and replies are optional.

8/31, Thu. The problem of faith and reason, then and now.

Strauss, *Natural Right and History*, ch. 3, first 17 ¶s, pp. 81-93 (philosophy grounded on the rejection of authority, i.e., of faith).

Aquinas, *Exposition of Boethius*, q.2, a.1-3, in *On Faith and Reason*, ed. Brown, pp. 25-39.

Nietzsche, “Reason in the Schools,” in *Portable Nietzsche*, 56-7 (*Human, All Too Human*, §265. Blackboard.

Heinrich Meier, *Lesson of Carl Schmitt*, 84-95 (political theology v. philosophic theol.). Blackboard.

Benedict XVI, Regensburg address, “Faith, Reason, and the University,” 2006. Blackboard.

Nietzsche, *Beyond Good and Evil*, §53, 55, 222. Blackboard.

OPTIONAL:

Hawthorne, *Scarlet Letter*, ch. 9, “The Leech” (man of faith vs. man of reason). Internet.

9/5. Reason, faith, and concealment in theology. How to read the Bible.

Aquinas, *Summa Theologiae*, I, Prologue, and q.1, a.9 all (should Holy Scripture use metaphors?). (The selections from I, q.1 are also in *On Faith and Reason*, ed. Brown.)

Exposition of Boethius, q.2, a.4. “Should Divine Realities be Veiled by Obscure and Novel Words?” in *On Faith and Reason*, ed. Brown, 39-42.

I, q.1, a.10 ad 3 (on metaphor in Scripture).

I, q.1, a.5 all (revelation needs the rational sciences as handmaidens).

I, q.68, a.1 resp.; a.2 resp.; a.3 resp. (reason must say what revelation means).

I-II, q.80, a.2 resp. (Devil works by images and appetites).

I-II, q.96, a.4 resp. (the meaning of the command not to resist evil).

II-II, q.55, a.6 resp.; a.7 resp. (solicitude for worldly things).

II-II, q.60, a.2 ad 1; a.6 all (“judge not”).

Leo Strauss, *Persecution and the Art of Writing*, ch. 1 (Introduction), 7-11, 18-21; all of ch. 2 (“Persecution”), 22-37.

Dyson, Aquinas *Political Writings*, xxiii-xxvi (the first 4 pages of “St. Thomas’s Political Thought”). Blackboard.

9/7. Happiness, free will, virtue, and reason.

I, q.95, a.2 resp. (human nature was the same before the fall).

I, q.98, a.2 resp. (man's original state was rational).

Strauss, *Thoughts on Machiavelli*, 201-2. Blackboard.

I-II, Prologue and Intro to q.1; also a.1 resp.; a.2 resp. (liberum arbitrium = free will; will is rational appetite).

I-II, q.3, a.1 resp. (God and happiness); a.2 ad 4 (contemplative vs. active life); a.5 resp. (happiness of this life is following practical intellect and virtue); a.8 resp. (happiness as vision of essence of first cause).

I-II, q.4, a.7 resp. (need for external goods); a.8 resp. (need for friends).

I-II, q.6, introduction (happiness requires certain voluntary human acts, i.e., virtues).

I-II, q.58 (read all the *respondeo*'s plus a.4 ad 3) (moral and intellectual virtues).

Hobbes, *Leviathan*, ch. 6, ¶53, 57 (deliberation).

Strauss, "Jerusalem and Athens," part I only, in *Studies in Platonic Pol. Phil.*, 147-66.

9/12. Law: one of the two external principles (motivations) of human acts.

I-II, q.90 all (law defined); q.91 all (4 kinds of law); q.92 all (effect of law and how it achieves this).

9/14. Eternal law, providence, revelation, miracles.

I-II, q.93 all (eternal law).

I, q.22, a.1 all; a.2 all; a.3 resp.; a.4 resp. (providence).

I, q.105, a.6 resp. and ad 1; a.7 resp. (miracles).

I-II, q.9, a.4 resp. (every person's will is ultimately moved by God).

Aristotle, *Eudemian Ethics*, bk. 8, 1248a25-27 (God moves everything in the soul).

Blackboard.

I-II, q.71, a.6 resp. and ad 4 & ad 5 (sin and eternal law).

I-II, q.101, a.3 resp. ("inclined to good, either from nature or from custom, or rather from grace").

II-II, q.83, a.2 all (prayer).

OPTIONAL:

Aquinas, *Summa contra Gentiles*, bk. 3, ch. 100-101. Blackboard.

TENTATIVE MAKE-UP CLASS. 9/17, Sunday, 4:00-5:30pm.

Natural law: (1) its content; (2) its basis in synderesis; (3) what is conscience?

I-II, q.94 all (natural law).

II-II q.64, a.7 resp. and ad 4 & ad 5 (killing in self-defense).

I, q.79, a.12-13 (conscience, synderesis).

I-II, q.19, a.5 all (conscience, synderesis).

II-II, q.47, a.6 all (conscience, synderesis).

Aristotle, *Nicomachean Ethics*, bk. 5, ch. 7 (on natural right). Blackboard.

Hobbes, *Leviathan*, ch. 14, ¶1-4. Also read the summaries of the 19 natural laws printed in the margins of ch. 14-15.

Locke, *Essay concerning Human Understanding*, bk. 1, ch. 3, §3, §13 (insufficient guidance of "synderesis"). Blackboard.

Locke, *First Treatise*, §86-9 + first sentence of §90 (basis of nat. law). *Second Treatise*, §6, §16, §56-7 (content of natural law).

9/19. OUT OF TOWN. NO CLASS.

9/21. Enforcement of natural law.

Review I-II, q.90-94 (look for discussions of punishment, esp. q. 91, a.6, on natural “punishments”).

I-II, q.69, a.2 ad 2 (natural “punishments” for violating natural law).

Hobbes, *Leviathan*, ch. 15, last two pages (natural laws are not really laws); ch. 31, ¶40 (God’s natural “punishments” for violating natural law).

Locke, *Second Treatise*, §7-8 (enforcement of natural law).

Locke, *Essay concerning Human Understanding*, bk. 1, ch. 3, §5-8, bk. 2, ch. 28, § 5-13.

Blackboard.

Strauss, *Natural Right and History*, 156-64.

Strauss, “On Natural Law,” in *Studies in Platonic Pol. Phil.*, 137-46.

Leo Strauss, *Persecution and the Art of Writing*, ch. 4, pp. 95-8 only.

Samuel West, *On the Right to Rebel*, 410-11 (moral sense). Blackboard.

OPTIONAL:

Ernest Fortin, “St. Thomas Aquinas,” in Strauss-Cropsey, 176-205 (but focus on 257-268).

Blackboard.

Plato, *Laws*, bk. 10 (the earliest presentation of a “natural law” doctrine). Blackboard.

Rousseau, *The First and Second Discourses*, pp. 33, 62-4, 94-6, 128-34. Blackboard.

James Q. Wilson, *The Moral Sense*. 1993. Blackboard.

9/26. Human law.

I-II, q.95-97 (human law).

Locke, *Second Treatise*, §123-126 (need for human law, and its purpose).

9/28. Examples of human law and the right to disobey a government.

Review I-II, q.96, a.4 ad 3 (obedience to unjust commands).

II-II, q.10, a.8 resp. (toleration); a.10 resp. (unbelieving rulers); a.11 resp. (toleration); a.12 resp. (no forced baptism).

II-II, q.11, a.3 resp. (heretics to be executed).

II-II, q.12, a.2 resp. (apostate rulers).

II-II, q.42, a.2 resp. and ad 3 (sedition and resistance to tyranny).

II-II, q.104, a.6 ad 3 (obedience to unjust commands).

II-II, q.40, a.1 all (charity and just war).

Hobbes, *Leviathan*, ch. 21, ¶11-16, ¶21 (right to disobey the sovereign)

Locke, *Second Treatise*, §207-210, §222, §226 (right to resist).

10/3. Just war and punishment.

II-II, q.108, a.1; a.2 resp.; a.3 resp. (“vengeance,” vindicatio, i.e. punishment).

Hobbes, *Leviathan*, ch. 15, ¶19; ch. 30, ¶23 (punishment)

Locke, *Second Treatise*, ch. 2, §7-8, §10, §159 (punishment).

C. S. Lewis, “The Humanitarian Theory of Punishment.” Blackboard.

OPTIONAL:

Pangle, Plato on punishment. Blackboard.

10/5. The Old Law

Review I-II, q.91, a.4-5 (divine law)

I-II, q.98, a.1 resp.; a.2 all; a.3 all; a.4 resp. and ad 2 & 3; a.5 resp.;

I-II, q.99, a.1-4 all; a.6 resp.

10/10. Moral and ceremonial precepts of the Old Law.

I-II, q.100, a.1 resp.; a.2 resp. and ad 4; a.3 all; a.4 ad 1; a.5 resp. and ad 1; a.8 all; a.11 resp.; a.12 resp. (moral precepts of Old Law).

I-II, q.101, a.1 resp. and ad 4; a.2 resp and ad 1; a.3 all (ceremonial precepts).

I-II, q.102, a.3 ad 12; a.6 ad 4 (two far-fetched explanations of ceremonial precepts).

10/12. Judicial precepts of the Old Law; the best regime; the New Law

I-II, q.104, a.1 resp. and ad 3 (judicial precepts of the Old Law).

I-II, q.105, a.1 all; a.2 resp. and ad 3; a.3 resp.; a.4 resp.; (judicial precepts and the best regime).

I-II, q.106, a.1 all (New Law).

I-II, q.107, a.1-2 all (New Law).

10/17. Overview of the 7 virtues.

Review I-II, q.58 (read all the respondeo's plus a.4 ad 3) (moral and intellectual virtues).

I-II, q.60, a.3 resp. (justice); a.5 resp. (other moral virtues).

I-II, q.61, a.1 resp. (cardinal or principal virtues); a.2 resp. (4 cardinal virtues).

I-II, q.62, a.1-4 resp. (theological virtues).

I-II, q.63, a.3-4 resp. (divinely infused virtues).

10/19. The virtue of (1) faith. Its relation to reason.

Review Aquinas, *Exposition of Boethius*, q.2, a.1-3, *On Faith and Reason*, ed. Brown, 25-39.

Aquinas, *Faith, Reason, and Theology*, 63-70 (*Exposition of Boethius*, q.3, a.1, "Is Faith Necessary?"). Blackboard.

II-II, Prologue (7 virtues and corresponding gifts and vices; the various states of mankind).

I, q.1, a.1 resp.; a.2 resp.; a.5 all; a.8 ad 2 (sacred doctrine).

I, q.32, a.1 resp. (can the Trinity be known by natural reason?).

I-II, q.67, a.3 resp. (faith defined).

II-II, q.1, a.1 resp.; a.4 resp.; a.5 all (on faith).

II-II, q.2, a.1 resp. and ad 1; a.4 resp.; a.6 resp.; a.7 resp. and ad 3; a.8 resp. (faith and knowledge; authority).

II-II, q.10, a.1 resp. (no one is punished for unbelief if they have not heard about the faith).

OPTIONAL:

Locke, *Reasonableness of Christianity*, 135-41 (marginal pagination) (ch.13 and beg. of ch. 14: salvation for non-Christians). Blackboard.

10/24. Conflicts between faith and reason.

Review Aquinas, *Exposition of Boethius*, q.2, a.3, pp. 36-7 only, in *On Faith and Reason*.

Review I, q.95, a.2 resp. (human nature was the same before the fall).

Review I, q.98, a.2 resp. (man's original state was rational).

Strauss, *Thoughts on Machiavelli*, 201-2. Blackboard.

I-II, q.63, a.4 resp. (fasting).

II-II, q.147, a.3 resp., a.4 resp. (fasting).

I-II, q.59, a.3 all (sorrow).

I-II, q.81, a.1-2 resp. (original sin).

I-II, q.87, a.8 resp. (original sin).

I-II, q.102, a.5 ad 3 (divorce).

I-II, q.105, a.4 ad 8 (divorce).

I-II, q.108, a.3 ad 2 (divorce).

II-II, q.45, a.4 resp. (philosophic vs. divine-law wisdom).

II-II, q.66, a.5 resp. (stealing from the Egyptians).

II-II, q.104, a.4 ad 2 (Abraham and Isaac; stealing from the Egyptians).

II-II, q.154, a.2 resp. (why fornication is a mortal sin).

Locke, *First Treatise*, compare §39 with §86 (right to eat meat).

Review Strauss, "Jerusalem and Athens," Part I, in *Studies in Platonic*.

OPTIONAL:

Locke, *Reasonableness of Christianity*, 121-35 (ch 12: Christ's commandments). Blackboard.

10/31. The virtues of (2) hope and (3) charity.

II-II, q.17, a.1 resp.; a.2 resp. (hope).

II-II, q.19, a.7 resp. (gift of fear as the beginning of wisdom).

II-II, q.23, a.1 resp.; a.3 resp.; a.5 resp.; a.7 resp. (charity: explained in terms of Aristotelian friendship).

II-II, q.24, a.1 resp.; a.2 resp.; a.3 resp. and ad 1 (charity is in us by infusion).

II-II, q.25, a.4 resp. and ad 3; a.5 resp.; a.6 resp.; a.8 resp.; a.12 (love of God, self, body, sinners, enemies, neighbor).

II-II, q.26, a.3-12 resp. (duties of love).

II-II, q.32, a.2 resp. (different kinds of almsdeeds—this is what we call charity today).

11/2. The virtues of (4) prudence, (5) justice, (6) fortitude or courage, (7) temperance.

II-II, q.47, a.6 all; a.10 resp. and ad 1; q.15 resp. (prudence, synderesis, political prudence).

II-II, q.49, a.2 resp. (insight into first practical principle is the foundation; cf. Aristotle).

II-II, q.50, a.4 resp. and ad 3 (military prudence).

II-II, q.55, a.6 all (solicitude for worldly things).

II-II, q.57, a.1 resp.; a.2 all; a.3 resp; a.4 resp. (on right and justice, ius and iustitia).

II-II, q.58, a.1 resp., a.2 resp., a.3 resp.; a.12 resp. (justice).

II-II, q.78, a.1 resp. and ad 2 & 3; a.2 all; a.3 resp.; a.4 resp. (usury forbidden but excused).

II-II, q.81, a.1 resp.; a.2 resp. and ad 3; a.4 resp.; a.5 resp. (religion as part of justice).

II-II, q.123, a.1-2 resp.; a.4-5 resp.; a.12 resp. (courage).

II-II, q.129, a.3 all and ad 4 (magnanimity and disgrace).

II-II, q.132, a.1 resp. (desire for glory not a sin).

II-II, q.136, a.2 resp. (patience inferior to fortitude and temperance).

II-II, q.141, a.1 resp. and ad 1 (temperance or moderation).

II-II, q.144, a.4 resp. (sense of shame).

II-II, q.161, a.1 all (humility).

II-II, q.162, a.3 ad 1 (Christ's depreciation of the wise and prudent).

OPTIONAL:

II-II, q.161, a.6. Benedict's rule, revised by Aquinas.

TENTATIVE MAKE-UP CLASS. 11/5, Sunday, 4:00-5:30pm.

What Is God?

Reread Strauss, "Jerusalem and Athens," 162-3 (the nature of God).

Aquinas, *On Truth*, q.23, a.6 resp. Blackboard.

I, q.2, a.3 resp. (5 ways to show that God exists).

I, q.3, a.4 resp. (ambiguity of "I am" or "I will be"); a.8 resp. (God not a part, i.e., not a thing).

I, q.7, a.1 resp. (infinite).

I, q.8, a.1 resp. (in all things).

I, q.9, a.1 resp. (immutable).

I, q.13, a.11 resp. (God's name).

I, q.18, a.3, read first ¶ of resp. (God has life).

I, q.20, a.2 resp. (God loves everything).

I, q.21, a.1 resp. (God is just, will of God).

I, q.25, a.3 resp. (omnipotence; God cannot do the impossible. Compare S.C.G. 2.25).

I, q.44, a.2 resp. (the meaning of creation); a.3 resp. ("cosmic DNA" in God's mind?).

I, q.46, a.1 ad 6 (creation out of nothing).

11/7. OUT OF TOWN. NO CLASS.

ALFARABI (b. 872 - educated and lived in Baghdad - died Damascus, Syria, 950). 3 days.

11/9. Alfarabi on practical and theoretical reason.

Review Benedict XVI, Regensburg address, "Faith, Reason, and the University." Blackboard.

Review Nietzsche, "Reason in the Schools." Blackboard.

Alfarabi, *Philosophy of Plato and Aristotle*, vii-x, 3-6 (from the Foreword and the 1962

Introduction). Also p. 13 (*Attainment of Happiness*, sec. 1-2 only), pp. 22-30 (sec. 18-29).

Strauss, *Persecution*, ch. 1 (Introduction), 7-21.

OPTIONAL:

Alfarabi, *Philosophy of Plato and Aristotle*, pp. vii-12 (the editors' foreword and two Introductions) and all of *Attainment*.

11/14. Alfarabi on the philosopher, prophet, Imam, and king.

Alfarabi, *Phil of Plato & Aris.*, pp. 30-50 (*Attainment*, sec. 30-64).

11/16. Alfarabi's correction of Socrates and his revision of Plato.

Alfarabi, *Phil. of Plato & Aris.*, pp 53-67 (all of *The Philosophy of Plato*).

Review Leo Strauss, *Persecution and the Art of Writing*, ch. 2, pp. 22-37.

MAIMONIDES (b. Cordoba, Andalusia (Spain) 1135 (?) - died in Egypt 1204). 5 days.

11/21. (1) purpose of *Guide*; (2) esotericism; (3) two views of the fall (Maimonides vs. Strauss).
Moses Maimonides, *Guide of the Perplexed*, vol. 1, pp. 5-9, 15-26 (part of Introduction, and ch. I.1 & I.2), pp. 56-57 (I.26).

Strauss, *Persecution*, selections from ch. 3, pp. 46-56.

11/28. (1) willful versus reasonable God; (2) miracles and nature; (3) “second cave.”
Maimonides, *Guide*, vol. 1, pp. 66-7 (end of I.31), 68-9 (§1 of I.32), 70-79 (I.33 & 34), 171, 174-5 (beginning and end of I.70), 175-84 (I.71).
Strauss, *Persecution*, bottom of 154 to top of 156 (“pit beneath the cave”).
Heinrich Meier, *Leo Strauss and the Theologico-Political Problem*, 55-62 (the “second cave” as the problem that links medieval and late modern thought). Blackboard.

11/30.(1) prophecy, (2) chariot (“divine science”), (3) providence.
Maimonides, *Guide*, vol. 2, pp. 360-66 (ch. II.32-33), 369-85 (II.36-40); pp. 415-16 (III.Intro.), pp. 422-23 (III.3), p. 427 (III.6), pp. 464-74 (III.17).
Strauss, “Jerusalem and Athens,” Part II only, in *Studies*, 167-73.

12/5. Providence and law.

Maimonides, *Guide*, pp. 474-77 (III.18), pp. 486-97 (III.22-23), pp. 502-14 (III.25-28). Also read the first 15 lines of p. 280 (near the end of II.12, on the imagination).

12/7. Politics and law.

Maimonides, *Guide*, pp. 514-38 (III.29-35), p. 550 (III.38), pp. 551-52 (5th para. of III.39, on humility), 553-54 (last 3 paragraphs of III.39, on pity).

COURSE REQUIREMENTS:

Paper 1. Counts about 20%. Tentative due date: Oct. 1. Details to come.

Paper 2. Counts about 45%. Tentative due date: Nov. 11. Details to come.

Final examination, about 15% of the grade.

Attendance, participation, preparation, “comments.” About 20%. More than 3 unexcused absences will affect this part of the grade. So also will failure to answer questions in class or otherwise show that you have understood the main points of the readings.

We will typically begin to discuss the readings on the day they are assigned and continue on the class day after that. Therefore, for any class day, students should prepare not only the readings assigned for that day, but also review the readings assigned for the previous class day.

“Comments.” Students are required to hand in 9 weekly printed “comments” at the beginning of class. Length: between 1/2 and one page, double-spaced, with one-inch margins. The quality of the “comments,” and how many of them are missing, will be a factor in the grade. Half the students will have a Tuesday due date, and the other half Thursday. I do not accept late comments. No comments are due during the first or last week. Students may skip some comments without penalty, as long as they hand in a total of 9 for the semester. For the weeks of Fall Break and Thanksgiving, all students have a Tuesday due date.

A high-quality comment will show that the student has understood the main point(s) of the assignment for that day. This will usually require mention of several passages in the readings. If

there are contrasting or surprising or apparently contradictory views in the readings, they should be specified.

Late work will be accepted (except for “comments”), but the grade will typically be lowered. The amount is at the discretion of the instructor.

TO CONTACT THE INSTRUCTOR:

Email: twest@hillsdale.edu. Cell phone 972-849-8515, 8:00am to 10:00pm. Leave a message or text me and I will respond. Office hours (Kendall 313): TuTh 11:00-11:15, 1:00-2:15, 3:45-4:00. I am often in the office at other times. Come by and knock. Or email, text, or phone.

OTHER MATTERS

Blackboard files are also in my Sugarsync folder: tinyurl.com/Medieval-17f

Computers and other electronic devices must be silenced and put away. This article explains: <http://pss.sagepub.com/content/25/6/1159> (“Advantages of Longhand Over Laptop Note Taking”).

Food and drinks are permitted if consumed silently and cleaned up afterward.

Reasonable disability accommodations will be granted with appropriate documentation.

REQUIRED TEXTS

Alfarabi. *Philosophy of Plato and Aristotle*. Trans. Muhsin Mahdi. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2002. ISBN-10: 0801487161. ISBN-13: 978-0801487163.

Aquinas. *On Faith and Reason*. Ed. Stephen F. Brown. Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing, 1999. ISBN-10: 0872204561. ISBN-13: 978-0872204560.

Aquinas, St. Thomas. *Summa Theologica* (5 volume set). Westminster, MD: Christian Classics, 1981. ISBN-10: 0870610694. ISBN-13: 978-087061069. If you know a little Latin, you should probably get one of the two versions that has Latin and English on facing pages instead of the Christian Classics version that the bookstore is ordering. I recommend St. Thomas Aquinas, *Summa Theologiae*, Latin-English Edition, ed. John Mortensen and Enrique Alarcon (Lander, WY: The Aquinas Institute, 2012), 8 volumes. ISBN-10: 1623400147. ISBN-13: 978-1623400149.

Hobbes, Thomas. *Leviathan*. Ed. Edwin Curley. Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company, 1994. ISBN-10: 0872201775. ISBN-13: 978-0872201774.

Locke, John. *Two Treatises of Government*. Ed. Peter Laslett. Cambridge University Press, 1988. ISBN-10: 0521357306. ISBN-13: 978-0521357302.

Maimonides, Moses. *The Guide of the Perplexed*. Trans. Shlomo Pines. Vol. 1. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1974. ISBN-10: 0226502309. ISBN-13: 978-0226502304.

Maimonides, Moses. *The Guide of the Perplexed*. Trans. Shlomo Pines. Vol. 2. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1974. ISBN-10: 0226502317. ISBN-13: 978-0226502311.

Strauss, Leo. *Natural Right and History*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1965. ISBN-10: 0226776948. ISBN-13: 978-0226776941.

Strauss, Leo. *Persecution and the Art of Writing*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1952. ISBN-10: 0226777111. ISBN-13: 978-0226777115.

Strauss, Leo. *Studies in Platonic Political Philosophy*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1985. ISBN-10: 0226777006. ISBN-13: 978-0226777009.